

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

**Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held
at County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 1st March, 2016 at 2.00 pm**

PRESENT: County Councillor P.R. Clarke (Vice Chairman)

County Councillors: D. Blakebrough, D.L.S. Dovey, D. Edwards,
R. Harris, B. Hayward, J. Higginson, P. Murphy, P. Watts, A. Webb
and A. Wintle

INVITED COUNCILLORS:

County Councillors G.L. Down, P. Farley, V.E. Smith and S. White

OFFICERS IN ATTENDANCE:

Philip Thomas	Development Services Manager
Paula Clarke	Planning Applications and Enforcement Manager
Robert Tranter	Head of Legal Services & Temporary Monitoring Officer
Mark Hand	Head of Planning
Richard Williams	Democratic Services Officer
Martin Davies	Planning Policy Manager
Jo Draper	

APOLOGIES:

Councillors R. Edwards, D. Evans, M. Powell, B. Strong and F. Taylor.

1. Declarations of Interest.

County Councillor S. White declared a personal and prejudicial interest under the Members' Code of Conduct in respect of application DC/2016/00107 as she farms the land adjacent to the site. As she is the local Member and was speaking on behalf of local objectors, she had taken advice from the Head of Legal Services. She addressed the Committee but was advised to leave the meeting immediately afterwards.

2. To confirm for accuracy the minutes of the previous meeting.

The Vice-Chairman confirmed and signed the minutes of the Planning Committee held on 2nd February 2016.

3. DC/2014/01533 - DETACHED DWELLING AND LAYBY PARKING SITE ADJACENT TO LION COTTAGE, TRELLECH ROAD, LLANDO.

We considered the report of the application which was recommended for approval subject to the 14 conditions as outlined in the report.

Councillor A. Thomas, representing Trellech Community Council, attended the meeting by invitation of the Vice-Chairman and outlined the following objections of the Community Council:

- Highway Safety concerns regarding the rural lane as it takes a considerable amount of east / west traffic across the Wye Valley linking up the Coleford

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 1st March, 2016 at 2.00 pm

Chepstow Road at Bigsweir Bridge. It also links traffic through Trellech onto the main routes to Abergavenny. Bigsweir Bridge is the crossing between the Forest of Dean and Monmouthshire through the centre of the Wye Valley between Monmouth and Chepstow.

- There is a blind spot at this location causing traffic issues.
- Llandogo is located in a Conservation Area as well as being located within the Wye Valley AONB and could be seen from many vantage points.
- Development had been occurring in isolation without recognising the duty to protect and enhance contributing to the ongoing decline over the previous 40 years.
- Residents living above the proposed dwelling have concerns regarding potential land slippage as building work could disturb underground water courses and could seriously jeopardise the higher properties within this location.
- There has been a history of land slippage in the area resulting in the road having to be closed for several months.
- The proposal to introduce additional parking will lead to road closure during construction and could seriously inconvenience the residents of Llandogo.

The applicant's agent, Mr. B. Spencer, attended to meeting by invitation of the Vice-Chairman and outlined the following points:

- With regard to rural safety, it is a rural lane but with the layby proposed to park vehicles in that location, it will not allow the vehicles to overlap onto the road. Therefore, it should be a highway gain.
- The Heritage Officer had concluded that conservation area would be enhanced and preserve the special character of the conservation area which complies with Planning Policy H2.
- The residents located above where the proposed works would take place would be for the management of the site to take into account and would form a small part of the works.
- Planning Officers, the Bio Diversity Officer and the Heritage Officer had recommended support for the application.

The local Member for Trellech and also a Planning Committee Member, expressed concern regarding the highway safety if this application was approved. The site inspection had revealed that the rural road was narrow and winding and considered that it was not a safe route to school.

Having considered the views expressed, some Members expressed their support for the application as it was noted at the site inspection that there was adequate room for

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 1st March, 2016 at 2.00 pm

vehicles to pass at this location. The design of the proposed dwelling was in keeping with the surrounding properties.

In response to a Member's question it was noted that the applicant would be willing to set back the retaining wall by a further 0.5 metre.

However, other Members expressed concern that the steepness of the site would require a considerable amount of earth to be removed to accommodate the proposed new dwelling. This was a concern as the area was notorious for land slippages.

It was noted that it was the responsibility of the developer to make the site safe for development.

Following the debate it was proposed by County Councillor P. Murphy and seconded by County Councillor D.L. Edwards that application DC/2014/01533 be approved subject to the 14 conditions, as outlined in the report and subject to the proposed retaining wall being set back by a further 0.5m.

Upon being put to the vote, the following votes were recorded:

For approval	5
Against Approval	4
Abstentions	2

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that application DC/2014/01533 be approved subject to the 14 conditions, as outlined in the report and subject to the proposed retaining wall being set back by a further 0.5m.

4. DC/2016/00107 - DEVELOPMENT OF 3,340 SQ M OF COMMERCIAL (B1 & B8) FLOORSFACE, STORAGE YARD, PARKING AND DEMOLITION OF EXISTING FARM BUILDINGS. LAND AT WONASTOW ROAD, MONMOUTH, NP25 5JA.

We considered the report of the application which was recommended for approval subject to the 26 conditions as outlined in the report. Also, that an additional archaeological condition should be added; an Flood Consequence Assessment (FCA) condition be added, an amendment to conditions 18 and 21 were required to allow for a Construction Management Plan (CMP); amend the drainage detail to accommodate French Drains for Model Farm.

The local Member for Overmonnow, attending the meeting by invitation of the Vice-Chairman, outlined the following points:

- She was representing a local objector to the application whose garden is frequently flooded.

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 1st March, 2016 at 2.00 pm

- The property has had a drainage ditch and has a soakaway. Concern was expressed that if the application was approved there may be detrimental consequences for the soakaway.
- The local land acts like a sponge collecting additional surface water.
- The drainage issues around Model Farm needed to be addressed. The Head of Planning stated that the applicant will install a new drainage pipe around Model Farm and water access will be focussed away from Model Farm.

Mr. D. Cummings, Chairman of Monmouth Chamber of Commerce and supporting the application, attended the meeting by invitation of the Vice-Chairman and outlined the following points:

- The Monmouth Chamber of Commerce were in support of the application.
- The applicant is a successful company and approval of this application would allow the company to double its workforce.
- Approval of the application will attract further businesses to the area.
- The site will provide adequate parking and landscaping.
- There is easy access to the site from the A40.

Members were informed that mechanisms would be put in place to ensure that surface water would be directed away from Model Farm. The Drainage Strategy will improve the current situation as additional water will run off into the attenuation pond.

A Planning Committee Member expressed concern that the drainage issues were being dealt with in a piecemeal fashion and that there were wider drainage issues in and around the site at Wonastow Road. Concern was also expressed that this site was designated as a B1 site in the Local Development Plan but was gradually becoming more of a B8 site. It was considered that before any further development should take place at this location a Flood Consequence Assessment (FCA) should be undertaken as flooding at this location regularly occurs at this site.

In response to the points raised it was noted that surface water drainage that would be stored in the attenuation pond would be released at a controlled rate. Currently, there was no control over surface water drainage release. The design of the proposed building reflects a high technology building.

Having considered the report and the views expressed, it was proposed by County Councillor P. Murphy and seconded by County Councillor R.J. Higginson that application DC/2016/00107 be approved subject to the 26 conditions as outlined in the report. Also, that an additional archaeological condition should be added; an Flood Consequence Assessment (FCA) condition be added, an amendment to conditions 18 and 21 were required to allow for a Construction Management Plan (CMP); amend the drainage detail to accommodate French Drains for Model Farm.

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 1st March, 2016 at 2.00 pm

Upon being put to the vote, the following votes were recorded:

In favour of the proposal	-	9
Against the proposal	-	1
Abstentions	-	1

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that application DC/2016/00107 be approved subject to the 26 conditions as outlined in the report. Also, that an additional archaeological condition should be added; an Flood Consequence Assessment (FCA) condition be added, an amendment to conditions 18 and 21 were required to allow for a Construction Management Plan (CMP); amend the drainage detail to accommodate French Drains for Model Farm.

5. DC/2014/01065 - DEMOLITION OF BUNGALOW, PARTIAL DEMOLITION OF EXISTING POULTRY UNITS, AND PROPOSED RETAIL / COMMERCIAL DEVELOPMENT TO PROVIDE 4 UNITS, ACCESS ARRANGEMENTS, CAR PARKING AND ASSOCIATED WORKS.

We considered the report of the application which was recommended for approval subject to the 21 conditions, as outlined in the report.

The Development Services Manager informed the Committee that this application had been presented to the Planning Committee on 5th January 2016 with a recommendation for approval. Consideration of the application had been deferred with a request for the Highways Department to examine justification and practicality of a pedestrian crossing being provided on Rockfield Road via a Section 106 Agreement.

The applicant had considered that the site proposed development would not warrant the provision of a pedestrian crossing on Rockfield Road. However, as a good will gesture it had been agreed that the applicant would provide a financial contribution towards the provision of a pedestrian crossing on Rockfield Road to provide betterment to the wider area. The financial contribution was in the sum of £8000, which equated to 50% of the cost of the desired crossing.

In response to a Member's question regarding the need for a pedestrian crossing at the site, the Highways Engineer stated that the applicant's submission was robust and did not justify the position of being eligible for a crossing patrol at this site. The financial contribution in the sum of £8000 would go towards providing local road safety enhancements.

Having considered the application and the views expressed, it was proposed by County Councillor A. Webb and seconded by County Councillor R.J. Higginson that application DC/2010/01065 be approved subject to the 21 conditions, as outlined in the report and subject to a financial contribution from the applicant, in the sum of £8000, to go towards providing local road safety enhancements.

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 1st March, 2016 at 2.00 pm

Upon being put to the vote, the following votes were recorded:

In favour of the proposal	6
Against the proposal	2
Abstentions	3

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that application DC/2010/01065 be approved subject to the 21 conditions, as outlined in the report and subject to a financial contribution from the applicant, in the sum of £8000, to go towards providing local road safety enhancements.

6. DC/2015/01260 - A CHANGE OF USE TO A WEDDING VENUE. DEMOLITION OF GARAGE WITHIN STABLE BLOCK AND EXTENSION BY ROOFING OVER AND ENCLOSING COURTYARD, ALTERATION OF STABLE AND COACH HOUSE BUILDINGS, CREATION OF NEW LINK BACK INTO EXISTING HOUSES TEWDRIC'S HOUSE, MATHERN ROAD, CHEPSTOW NP16 6HX.

We considered the report of the application subject to the conditions, as outlined in the report.

The local Member for Shirenewton, attending the meeting by invitation of the Vice-Chairman, outlined the following points:

- A large number of objections have been received in respect of this application.
- The January 2016 edition of Planning Policy Wales states that the substance of local views must be considered which were considered to be a material planning consideration that should be taken into account in determining an application.
- The public have overwhelmingly stated that they are against approval of the application.
- The site is not designated as an employment site within the Local Development Plan.
- There is no real business plan or proposal. There is no evidence that this proposal has been considered as a business.
- The economic benefits will be limited. Guests will not be able to remain on site overnight. Weddings tend to be one day events. There is limited accommodation for guests in the locality.
- Very few jobs will be created.
- Concern was expressed regarding the potential for such events to create noise and lead to complaints being made by local residents. Also, the noise generated would potentially disturb local livestock.

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 1st March, 2016 at 2.00 pm

- There are only 50 car parking spaces for a maximum of 150 guests and staff. This could lead to vehicles having to park on the lane outside of the venue.
- The road into Mathern is a narrow and dangerous lane. Traffic along this road should be discouraged.
- Signposting to the venue would direct traffic through the village of Mathern.
- The local member asked the Committee to consider refusing the application. If the Committee decided to approve it, the local Member asked that the following conditions be taken into account:
 - Traffic Management arrangements – improve the entrance and exit to the venue.
 - Fireworks to be let off no later than 10.00pm.
 - Music to cease by 11.00pm.

Members expressed their support for the application. However, some concerns were raised in respect of the traffic management arrangements

In response to the local Member's sum up regarding the suggested conditions, the Head of Planning stated that these issues were not subject to planning conditions and should be addressed via other means.

Having considered the report and the views expressed, it was proposed by County Councillor R.J. Higginson and seconded by County Councillor A.E. Webb that application DC/2015/01260 be approved subject to the conditions, as outlined in the report.

Upon being put to the vote, the following votes were recorded:

For approval	-	10
Against approval	-	0
Abstentions	-	1

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that application DC/2015/01260 be approved subject to the conditions, as outlined in the report.

7. DC/2015/01542 - THE INSTALLATION OF A FREESTANDING 7M HIGH TOTEM SIGN WESTGATE, LAND OFF MERTHYR ROAD, LLANFOIST.

We considered the application which was presented for refusal for one reason, as outlined in the report.

The majority of the Committee agreed with the officer recommendation to refuse the application. However, one Member expressed support for the application as it was

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 1st March, 2016 at 2.00 pm

considered that the free standing totem sign would provide advanced information to motorists.

It was therefore proposed by County Councillor D.L. Edwards and seconded by County Councillor R.G. Harris that application DC/2015/01542 be refused for the one reason, as outlined in the report.

Upon being put to the vote, the following votes were recorded:

For refusal	9
Against refusal	1
Abstentions	1

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that application DC/2015/01542 be refused for the one reason, as outlined in the report.

8. The Two Rivers, Hilltop, Newport Road, Chepstow.

We received the Planning Inspectorate report which related to an appeal decision following a site visit on 19th January 2016, site - The Two Rivers, Hilltop, Newport Road, Chepstow NP16 5BT.

The appeal was allowed.

9. Land Adjacent to No.1 Greenfield, Caldicot.

We received the Planning Inspectorate report which related to an appeal decision following a site visit on 5th January 2016, site - Land adjacent to No. 1 Greenfield, Caldicot, Monmouthshire, NP26 4NB.

The appeal had been dismissed.

10. Tyr Berllan, Llangwm, Usk.

We received the Planning Inspectorate report which related to an appeal decision following a site visit on 2nd February 2016, site - Tyr Berllan, Llangwym, Usk, NP15 1HB

The appeal was allowed.

11. MONMOUTHSHIRE CONSERVATION AREAS REVIEW OF DESIGNATED CONSERVATION AREAS.

We received a report in which Members were asked to endorse the Conservation Area Appraisals as amended in the light of the public consultation, with a view to them being formally adopted as SPG in connection with the Monmouthshire LDP and to note further work required including consideration of the need for Article 4 Directions and of potential new conservation areas in Abergavenny and Chepstow.

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 1st March, 2016 at 2.00 pm

Having received the report it was noted that Garden City was being considered as a conservation area as it was its centenary year and we as an authority should be looking to include 20th Century buildings within our conservation areas. However, it was noted that the Committee might need to adopt a pragmatic approach with a view to providing some form of protection to the area.

We resolved:

- (i) to note the officer responses to the comments received during the public consultation.
- (ii) to endorse the adoption of the amended Conservation Area Appraisals as Supplementary Planning Guidance by the Cabinet Member.
- (iii) to endorse further work regarding Article 4 Directions and to further consider an additional conservation area in Abergavenny and in Chepstow, with the necessary associated public consultation process.

12. MONMOUTHSHIRE LOCAL DEVELOPMENT PLAN RENEWABLE ENERGY AND ENERGY EFFICIENCY SUPPLEMENTARY PLANNING GUIDANCE.

County Councillors R. Hayward, D.L. Edwards and D. Blakebrough left the meeting before consideration of this item.

We received a report in which Members were advised of the results of the consultation on Draft Supplementary Planning Guidance (SPG) on Renewable Energy and Energy Efficiency (REEE) to support the policies of the Monmouthshire Local Development Plan (LDP) and a Draft Planning Advice Note on Wind Turbine Development: Landscape and Visual Impact Assessment (LVIA) Requirements.

We resolved:

- i) to endorse the Draft REEE SPG and to recommend to the Cabinet Member accordingly, with a view to the document being formally adopted as SPG to support the Monmouthshire LDP.
- ii) to endorse the Draft Planning Advice Note on Wind Turbine Development: LVIA Requirements and to recommend to the Cabinet Member accordingly, with a view to it being formally adopted as an advice note to assist in the determination of planning applications for Wind Turbine Schemes.

13. MONMOUTHSHIRE LOCAL DEVELOPMENT PLAN AFFORDABLE HOUSING SUPPLEMENTARY PLANNING GUIDANCE.

We received a report in which Members were advised of the results of the recent consultation on Draft Supplementary Planning Guidance (SPG) on Affordable Housing to support the policies of the Monmouthshire Local Development Plan (LDP).

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

**Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held
at County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 1st March, 2016 at 2.00 pm**

We resolved to endorse the SPG with a view to it being formally adopted as SPG in connection with the Monmouthshire LDP to take effect from 1st April 2016 and to recommend to Cabinet and Council accordingly.

The meeting ended at 5.05pm